



Public Document Pack

Cambridge City Council

ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

To: Councillors Kightley (Chair), Saunders (Vice-Chair), Herbert, Marchant-Daisley, Owers, Tucker, Tunnacliffe, Wright and Znajek

Alternate Councillors: Ashton, Kerr and Pogonowski

Executive Councillor for Planning and Sustainable Transport: Councillor Ward

Executive Councillor for Environmental and Waste Services: Councillor Swanson

Despatched: Monday, 2 January 2012

Date: Tuesday, 10 January 2012

Time: 4.00 pm

Venue: Committee Room 1 & 2 - Guildhall

Contact: James Goddard **Direct Dial:** 01223 457015

AGENDA – FOURTH CIRCULATION

- 7 ROUTE OPTIMISATION PROJECT FOR REFUSE AND RECYCLING COLLECTIONS - OPTIONS FOR CHANGE** *(Pages 1 - 4)*

Information for the public

Public attendance

You are welcome to attend this meeting as an observer, although it will be necessary to ask you to leave the room during the discussion of matters which are described as confidential.

Public Speaking

You can ask questions on an issue included on either agenda above, or on an issue which is within this committee's powers. Questions can only be asked during the slot on the agenda for this at the beginning of the meeting, not later on when an issue is under discussion by the committee.

If you wish to ask a question related to an agenda item contact the committee officer (listed above under 'contact') **before the meeting starts**. If you wish to ask a question on a matter not included on this agenda, please contact the committee officer by 10.00am the working day before the meeting. Further details concerning the right to speak at committee can be obtained from the committee section.

Filming, recording and photography at council meetings is allowed subject to certain restrictions and prior agreement from the chair of the meeting.

Requests to film, record or photograph, whether from a media organisation or a member of the public, must be made to the democratic services manager at least three working days before the meeting.

Fire Alarm

In the event of the fire alarm sounding (which is a continuous ringing sound), you should pick up your possessions and leave the building by the route you came in. Once clear of the building, you should assemble on the pavement opposite the main entrance to the Guildhall and await further instructions. If your escape route or the assembly area is unsafe, you will be directed to safe areas by a member of Cambridge City Council staff.

Addendum to Route Optimisation Report for ESC 10/1/12

1 Options for Change

- 1.1 This addendum provides further information and analysis about the Route Optimisation Project and should be read and considered in conjunction with the main report at Agenda Item 7. The intention is for the domestic refuse rounds to be used as a template for the mapping of all 3 waste streams (refuse, dry recycling and organic waste) in order to determine the most suitable work pattern. The mapping of the blue and green bin rounds will mirror, by day, the refuse round mapping work.
- 1.2 It is also anticipated that Commercial Waste Services will follow the same work pattern from July 2012 after a separate route optimisation exercise.
- 1.3 The report outlines various options for change to the way in which refuse and recycling is collected. Analysis of the suitability of the options outlined at 3.9 in the main report, against various criteria (such as growth, capacity and health and safety) has been carried out and the findings are discussed below.

2 Findings

- 2.1 The option detailed at 3.9.1 in the report, for re-routing existing rounds only, does not provide sufficient savings or operational efficiencies within the current financial constraints.
- 2.2 The option at 3.9.2 (4 days with 3.5 vehicles) would provide vehicle and staff savings. It is also the option that would provide additional savings from reduced overtime for bank holiday working. This option would yield a saving of £122,000 p.a. for vehicle and staff plus an estimated £11,000 p.a. for bank holiday overtime. This gives total savings for this option of £133,000 p.a. It is proposed that this option be taken forward.
- 2.3 The option at 3.9.3 (5 days with 3 vehicles) is not considered further as the modelling work has shown that this is not

feasible because the criteria given above in 1.3 are not achievable.

- 2.4 Analysis of the option at 3.9.4 (5 days with 3.5 vehicles) shows that this would be very similar to the 4 day working week above and it is therefore proposed that this is the second of the two options to be taken forward. This option would yield a saving of £122,000 p.a., which would include a reduction in Repair & Renewal contributions and reduction in transport costs.

3 Other Changes – Top loader vehicles

- 3.1 It is also now proposed to consider the two vehicles that collect recyclables from the bring banks (banks at supermarket car parks etc), certain colleges and flats, within the route optimisation work. It is proposed to change this part of the service by moving collections at colleges and flats from segregated collections of recyclables to commingled collections. The remainder of the segregated collections are for the bring sites and would stay with the one remaining vehicle, at this stage. This would offer greater flexibility to residents and provide easier facilities for recycling. This change would be likely to be complete by October 2012 but may be introduced at the same time as other changes. The new commingled rounds would be mapped with capacity to cover these extra collections. The saving that this would generate is £46,352 for 2012/13 and £92,704 p.a. thereafter.

- 3.2 The route optimisation of bring bank services would be carried out in order to establish the best routes and collection schedule at a later date, and due to the change in the nature of the work and the fact that collections would be reallocated to blue bin vehicles, it has been possible to establish that the service could be reduced by one vehicle. Further work on the full mapping exercise will need to be undertaken on this proposal.

4 Other Changes – Management changes

- 4.1 It is also proposed to reduce the number of Refuse Team Leaders from four to two. Officers are exploring options for the reallocation of some of the Team Leader responsibilities

to be incorporated in the new administrative function from the business and support review and are exploring the potential for a leading hand role within each waste stream to provide a lower level management structure. The proposal is that each collection stream (refuse, dry recycling, organic waste and trade services) would have a leading hand position responsible for certain aspects of the running of that element of the service. The deletion of the two posts would generate savings of approximately £64,000 p.a. and includes a figure for the re-evaluation of leading hand posts.

5 Rationale

5.1 Officers have been focusing attention on the two options for the domestic rounds that reduce the service by one vehicle as these are considered to be the most feasible in terms of providing savings and providing the necessary assurance of achievability. One vehicle equates to two week's worth of work ie one vehicle is 10 rounds collected over a fortnight, therefore half a vehicle per waste stream is 5 rounds or one week's work.

5.2 **Option 1 - 4 day week 3.5 vehicles for each stream** - This option would provide the service over a 4 day standard shift pattern based on staff working a 37 hour week but over 4 longer days instead of 5 days. Each round would have more work allocated to it but this would be carried out within the 37 hour week. The advantage of this system is that economies could be gained through fuller vehicle loads (ie higher tonnage could be achieved on the second trip to the tipping site). There are also advantages around the fact that if this option were agreed, the likely working week would be Tuesday to Friday. This would result in some small savings on overtime payments to staff associated with bank holiday Mondays. It is therefore a simpler system for residents as there is no shifting of collection day in weeks where there is a bank holiday. However, this saving is unclear as it would depend on the pay, terms and conditions negotiations which have not yet concluded. This change would result in fewer catch-up days having to be worked as a result of bank holidays. For some staff this change in working week, resulting in 3 days off instead of 2, might be viewed as beneficial. For others however, working a longer day may be

problematic and create complications for people with family commitments (eg child care responsibilities for young school children).

- 5.3 **Option 2 - 5 day week 3.5 vehicles for each stream** – This option would provide a working pattern similar to the existing one, although, as above, each round would have more work allocated to it each day for completion within a 5 day, 37 hour week. One advantage of this system is that there would be less change to working patterns for staff. This might be advantageous to some staff.
- 5.4 It is proposed that the mapping work will continue over the coming months to fine tune the proposals, in parallel with the proposed staff consultation, which will be asking staff for their opinions on the two proposed working patterns eg 4 or 5 day working week, start times, supervision and other matters related to their work.

6 Summary

- 6.1 The results of the staff and union informal consultation will be known after 20/1/12 and will feed into the formal 30 day consultation, under the council's organisational change policy. However, officers are seeking approval from the Executive Councillor to reduce the service, with associated collection and management staff, by 2 vehicles, one from the main bin collection rounds for refuse and recycling and one from the bring bank, colleges and flats service.
- 6.2 Subject to the results of the staff and union consultation and discussion and consultation with the Executive Councillor, Chair and Opposition Spokespersons, the Director of Environment will implement the preferred option (either 4 or 5 day week).